

PENNSYLVANIA COMPENSATION RATING BUREAU

Measures of Goodness of Fit in Trend Calculations Using Loss Ratios

Estimates of trended loss ratios using from 4 to 10 data points for each loss development technique are shown in Exhibit 6 of this mailing.

The first page of the attachment shows  $R^2$  values for the regressions producing those trended loss ratios.

Pages 2 and 3 show indemnity fitted loss ratios for each loss development method using from 4 to 10 data points. Page 2 uses linear regression and page 3 uses exponential techniques. Pages 4 and 5 present analogous results for medical-linear and medical-exponential respectively.

Pages 6 through 9 show residuals resulting from the comparison of actual and fitted (actual minus fitted) values for the curves used in the trend projections. Page 6 shows indemnity results using linear regression, page 7 is for indemnity-exponential, page 8 for medical-linear and page 9 for medical-exponential.

INDEMNITY		Average	(Incur)	(Pd-23)
r^2		(Pd & Inc)		
4 Point	Linear	0.076	0.276	0.542
5 Point	Linear	0.141	0.236	0.605
6 Point	Linear	0.076	0.561	0.140
7 Point	Linear	0.248	0.675	0.008
8 Point	Linear	0.496	0.772	0.121
9 Point	Linear	0.640	0.836	0.322
10 Point	Linear	0.735	0.875	0.502
4 Point	Expon'l	0.079	0.282	0.546
5 Point	Expon'l	0.142	0.242	0.604
6 Point	Expon'l	0.072	0.563	0.139
7 Point	Expon'l	0.240	0.675	0.008
8 Point	Expon'l	0.489	0.777	0.113
9 Point	Expon'l	0.633	0.838	0.308
10 Point	Expon'l	0.732	0.879	0.488

MEDICAL		Average	(Incur)	(Pd-23)
r^2		(Pd & Inc)		
4 Point	Linear	0.066	0.121	0.014
5 Point	Linear	0.143	0.241	0.036
6 Point	Linear	0.476	0.527	0.397
7 Point	Linear	0.422	0.455	0.364
8 Point	Linear	0.385	0.437	0.305
9 Point	Linear	0.247	0.286	0.189
10 Point	Linear	0.412	0.462	0.326
4 Point	Expon'l	0.065	0.123	0.013
5 Point	Expon'l	0.146	0.247	0.036
6 Point	Expon'l	0.475	0.529	0.394
7 Point	Expon'l	0.426	0.461	0.366
8 Point	Expon'l	0.392	0.444	0.310
9 Point	Expon'l	0.254	0.295	0.194
10 Point	Expon'l	0.416	0.467	0.330

INDEMNITY Linear <b>FITTED</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	0.4903	0.4734	0.5072
	2007	0.4932	0.4674	0.5190
	2008	0.4961	0.4615	0.5308
	2009	0.4990	0.4556	0.5426
5 Point	2005	0.4874	0.4733	0.5014
	2006	0.4903	0.4694	0.5112
	2007	0.4932	0.4654	0.5210
	2008	0.4961	0.4615	0.5308
	2009	0.4990	0.4576	0.5406
6 Point	2004	0.5037	0.4935	0.5139
	2005	0.5014	0.4851	0.5176
	2006	0.4991	0.4768	0.5213
	2007	0.4967	0.4684	0.5250
	2008	0.4944	0.4600	0.5288
	2009	0.4920	0.4517	0.5325
7 Point	2003	0.5127	0.5022	0.5232
	2004	0.5088	0.4937	0.5239
	2005	0.5049	0.4853	0.5246
	2006	0.5011	0.4769	0.5253
	2007	0.4972	0.4684	0.5260
	2008	0.4934	0.4600	0.5268
	2009	0.4895	0.4516	0.5275
8 Point	2002	0.5326	0.5230	0.5423
	2003	0.5256	0.5121	0.5391
	2004	0.5185	0.5012	0.5358
	2005	0.5114	0.4902	0.5326
	2006	0.5043	0.4793	0.5293
	2007	0.4972	0.4684	0.5260
	2008	0.4901	0.4575	0.5228
	2009	0.4831	0.4466	0.5195
9 Point	2001	0.5474	0.5357	0.5591
	2002	0.5389	0.5245	0.5535
	2003	0.5305	0.5132	0.5478
	2004	0.5221	0.5020	0.5422
	2005	0.5136	0.4908	0.5365
	2006	0.5052	0.4795	0.5309
	2007	0.4968	0.4683	0.5253
	2008	0.4883	0.4571	0.5196
	2009	0.4799	0.4459	0.5140
10 Point	2000	0.5676	0.5550	0.5802
	2001	0.5573	0.5425	0.5721
	2002	0.5470	0.5300	0.5641
	2003	0.5367	0.5175	0.5560
	2004	0.5264	0.5050	0.5479
	2005	0.5161	0.4925	0.5398
	2006	0.5058	0.4800	0.5317
	2007	0.4955	0.4675	0.5236
	2008	0.4852	0.4550	0.5155
	2009	0.4749	0.4425	0.5074

INDEMNITY Expon'l <b>FITTED</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	0.4901	0.4734	0.5069
	2007	0.4930	0.4673	0.5186
	2008	0.4960	0.4613	0.5306
	2009	0.4990	0.4554	0.5429
5 Point	2005	0.4873	0.4734	0.5014
	2006	0.4902	0.4693	0.5109
	2007	0.4931	0.4653	0.5207
	2008	0.4960	0.4613	0.5306
	2009	0.4990	0.4573	0.5407
6 Point	2004	0.5034	0.4934	0.5136
	2005	0.5011	0.4848	0.5173
	2006	0.4988	0.4764	0.5210
	2007	0.4965	0.4681	0.5248
	2008	0.4943	0.4599	0.5286
	2009	0.4921	0.4519	0.5324
7 Point	2003	0.5124	0.5023	0.5229
	2004	0.5085	0.4935	0.5236
	2005	0.5047	0.4849	0.5243
	2006	0.5008	0.4764	0.5251
	2007	0.4971	0.4681	0.5258
	2008	0.4933	0.4599	0.5265
	2009	0.4896	0.4519	0.5273
8 Point	2002	0.5322	0.5231	0.5416
	2003	0.5250	0.5116	0.5384
	2004	0.5178	0.5004	0.5352
	2005	0.5108	0.4894	0.5321
	2006	0.5039	0.4786	0.5289
	2007	0.4971	0.4681	0.5258
	2008	0.4903	0.4578	0.5227
	2009	0.4837	0.4477	0.5196
9 Point	2001	0.5471	0.5363	0.5584
	2002	0.5384	0.5243	0.5527
	2003	0.5298	0.5125	0.5470
	2004	0.5213	0.5010	0.5414
	2005	0.5129	0.4898	0.5359
	2006	0.5047	0.4788	0.5304
	2007	0.4966	0.4680	0.5250
	2008	0.4887	0.4575	0.5197
	2009	0.4809	0.4472	0.5144
10 Point	2000	0.5675	0.5560	0.5794
	2001	0.5566	0.5424	0.5711
	2002	0.5460	0.5291	0.5629
	2003	0.5355	0.5161	0.5548
	2004	0.5252	0.5035	0.5468
	2005	0.5151	0.4911	0.5390
	2006	0.5053	0.4791	0.5312
	2007	0.4956	0.4674	0.5236
	2008	0.4861	0.4559	0.5160
	2009	0.4767	0.4447	0.5086

MEDICAL Linear <b>FITTED</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	0.4849	0.4682	0.5017
	2007	0.4820	0.4634	0.5006
	2008	0.4791	0.4587	0.4995
	2009	0.4761	0.4539	0.4984
5 Point	2005	0.4887	0.4741	0.5033
	2006	0.4855	0.4689	0.5020
	2007	0.4823	0.4638	0.5008
	2008	0.4791	0.4587	0.4995
	2009	0.4759	0.4535	0.4983
6 Point	2004	0.5060	0.4902	0.5218
	2005	0.4989	0.4821	0.5158
	2006	0.4919	0.4739	0.5099
	2007	0.4848	0.4658	0.5039
	2008	0.4778	0.4577	0.4980
	2009	0.4707	0.4495	0.4920
7 Point	2003	0.5056	0.4894	0.5218
	2004	0.5003	0.4833	0.5173
	2005	0.4949	0.4773	0.5127
	2006	0.4896	0.4712	0.5081
	2007	0.4843	0.4651	0.5035
	2008	0.4789	0.4590	0.4989
	2009	0.4736	0.4530	0.4943
8 Point	2002	0.5054	0.4900	0.5208
	2003	0.5012	0.4850	0.5173
	2004	0.4969	0.4800	0.5138
	2005	0.4927	0.4751	0.5104
	2006	0.4885	0.4701	0.5069
	2007	0.4843	0.4651	0.5035
	2008	0.4800	0.4601	0.5000
	2009	0.4758	0.4552	0.4965
	9 Point	2001	0.5017	0.4859
2002		0.4989	0.4825	0.5152
2003		0.4961	0.4791	0.5130
2004		0.4932	0.4758	0.5107
2005		0.4904	0.4724	0.5084
2006		0.4876	0.4690	0.5061
2007		0.4847	0.4656	0.5039
2008		0.4819	0.4623	0.5016
2009		0.4791	0.4589	0.4993
10 Point	2000	0.5103	0.4970	0.5236
	2001	0.5066	0.4924	0.5208
	2002	0.5028	0.4878	0.5179
	2003	0.4991	0.4832	0.5150
	2004	0.4954	0.4786	0.5121
	2005	0.4916	0.4740	0.5092
	2006	0.4879	0.4694	0.5063
	2007	0.4841	0.4648	0.5035
	2008	0.4804	0.4602	0.5006
	2009	0.4766	0.4556	0.4977

MEDICAL Expon'l <b>FITTED</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	0.4847	0.4679	0.5016
	2007	0.4818	0.4632	0.5005
	2008	0.4789	0.4584	0.4994
	2009	0.4760	0.4538	0.4984
5 Point	2005	0.4886	0.4740	0.5032
	2006	0.4853	0.4687	0.5020
	2007	0.4821	0.4636	0.5007
	2008	0.4789	0.4584	0.4994
	2009	0.4757	0.4534	0.4982
6 Point	2004	0.5058	0.4901	0.5215
	2005	0.4986	0.4818	0.5155
	2006	0.4915	0.4735	0.5096
	2007	0.4846	0.4655	0.5037
	2008	0.4777	0.4575	0.4979
	2009	0.4709	0.4497	0.4922
7 Point	2003	0.5056	0.4895	0.5217
	2004	0.5001	0.4832	0.5170
	2005	0.4947	0.4770	0.5124
	2006	0.4893	0.4708	0.5078
	2007	0.4840	0.4648	0.5033
	2008	0.4788	0.4588	0.4988
	2009	0.4736	0.4529	0.4943
8 Point	2002	0.5054	0.4902	0.5207
	2003	0.5011	0.4850	0.5172
	2004	0.4968	0.4798	0.5137
	2005	0.4925	0.4748	0.5102
	2006	0.4882	0.4698	0.5067
	2007	0.4840	0.4648	0.5033
	2008	0.4799	0.4599	0.4999
	2009	0.4757	0.4550	0.4965
9 Point	2001	0.5017	0.4860	0.5175
	2002	0.4988	0.4825	0.5151
	2003	0.4959	0.4790	0.5128
	2004	0.4930	0.4755	0.5105
	2005	0.4902	0.4721	0.5082
	2006	0.4873	0.4687	0.5059
	2007	0.4845	0.4653	0.5037
	2008	0.4817	0.4620	0.5014
	2009	0.4789	0.4586	0.4992
10 Point	2000	0.5104	0.4971	0.5236
	2001	0.5065	0.4923	0.5207
	2002	0.5027	0.4876	0.5177
	2003	0.4989	0.4829	0.5148
	2004	0.4951	0.4782	0.5119
	2005	0.4913	0.4736	0.5090
	2006	0.4876	0.4691	0.5061
	2007	0.4839	0.4646	0.5033
	2008	0.4802	0.4601	0.5005
	2009	0.4766	0.4557	0.4976

INDEMNITY Linear <b>RESIDUALS</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	-0.0118	-0.0115	-0.0121
	2007	0.0128	0.0134	0.0122
	2008	0.0099	0.0077	0.0120
	2009	-0.0108	-0.0096	-0.0121
5 Point	2005	0.0000	-0.0040	0.0040
	2006	-0.0118	-0.0075	-0.0161
	2007	0.0128	0.0154	0.0102
	2008	0.0099	0.0077	0.0120
	2009	-0.0108	-0.0116	-0.0101
6 Point	2004	0.0175	0.0148	0.0202
	2005	-0.0140	-0.0158	-0.0122
	2006	-0.0206	-0.0149	-0.0262
	2007	0.0093	0.0124	0.0062
	2008	0.0116	0.0092	0.0140
	2009	-0.0038	-0.0057	-0.0020
7 Point	2003	0.0076	0.0003	0.0150
	2004	0.0124	0.0146	0.0102
	2005	-0.0175	-0.0160	-0.0192
	2006	-0.0226	-0.0150	-0.0302
	2007	0.0088	0.0124	0.0052
	2008	0.0126	0.0092	0.0160
	2009	-0.0013	-0.0056	0.0030
8 Point	2002	0.0226	0.0173	0.0278
	2003	-0.0053	-0.0096	-0.0009
	2004	0.0027	0.0071	-0.0017
	2005	-0.0240	-0.0209	-0.0272
	2006	-0.0258	-0.0174	-0.0342
	2007	0.0088	0.0124	0.0052
	2008	0.0159	0.0117	0.0200
	2009	0.0051	-0.0006	0.0110
	9 Point	2001	0.0126	0.0030
2002		0.0163	0.0158	0.0166
2003		-0.0102	-0.0107	-0.0096
2004		-0.0009	0.0063	-0.0081
2005		-0.0262	-0.0215	-0.0311
2006		-0.0267	-0.0176	-0.0358
2007		0.0092	0.0125	0.0060
2008		0.0177	0.0121	0.0232
2009		0.0083	0.0001	0.0165
10 Point	2000	0.0223	0.0153	0.0294
	2001	0.0027	-0.0038	0.0093
	2002	0.0082	0.0103	0.0060
	2003	-0.0164	-0.0150	-0.0178
	2004	-0.0052	0.0033	-0.0138
	2005	-0.0287	-0.0232	-0.0344
	2006	-0.0273	-0.0181	-0.0366
	2007	0.0105	0.0133	0.0076
	2008	0.0208	0.0142	0.0273
	2009	0.0133	0.0035	0.0231

INDEMNITY Expon'l <b>RESIDUALS</b>	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	-0.0116	-0.0115	-0.0118
	2007	0.0130	0.0135	0.0126
	2008	0.0100	0.0079	0.0122
	2009	-0.0108	-0.0094	-0.0124
5 Point	2005	0.0001	-0.0041	0.0040
	2006	-0.0117	-0.0074	-0.0158
	2007	0.0129	0.0155	0.0105
	2008	0.0100	0.0079	0.0122
	2009	-0.0108	-0.0113	-0.0102
6 Point	2004	0.0178	0.0149	0.0205
	2005	-0.0137	-0.0155	-0.0119
	2006	-0.0203	-0.0145	-0.0259
	2007	0.0095	0.0127	0.0064
	2008	0.0117	0.0093	0.0142
	2009	-0.0039	-0.0059	-0.0019
7 Point	2003	0.0079	0.0002	0.0153
	2004	0.0127	0.0148	0.0105
	2005	-0.0173	-0.0156	-0.0189
	2006	-0.0223	-0.0145	-0.0300
	2007	0.0089	0.0127	0.0054
	2008	0.0127	0.0093	0.0163
	2009	-0.0014	-0.0059	0.0032
8 Point	2002	0.0230	0.0172	0.0285
	2003	-0.0047	-0.0091	-0.0002
	2004	0.0034	0.0079	-0.0011
	2005	-0.0234	-0.0201	-0.0267
	2006	-0.0254	-0.0167	-0.0338
	2007	0.0089	0.0127	0.0054
	2008	0.0157	0.0114	0.0201
	2009	0.0045	-0.0017	0.0109
	9 Point	2001	0.0129	0.0024
2002		0.0168	0.0160	0.0174
2003		-0.0095	-0.0100	-0.0088
2004		-0.0001	0.0073	-0.0073
2005		-0.0255	-0.0205	-0.0305
2006		-0.0262	-0.0169	-0.0353
2007		0.0094	0.0128	0.0062
2008		0.0173	0.0117	0.0231
2009		0.0073	-0.0012	0.0161
10 Point	2000	0.0224	0.0143	0.0302
	2001	0.0034	-0.0037	0.0103
	2002	0.0092	0.0112	0.0072
	2003	-0.0152	-0.0136	-0.0166
	2004	-0.0040	0.0048	-0.0127
	2005	-0.0277	-0.0218	-0.0336
	2006	-0.0268	-0.0172	-0.0361
	2007	0.0104	0.0134	0.0076
	2008	0.0199	0.0133	0.0268
	2009	0.0115	0.0013	0.0219



MEDICAL Linear RESIDUALS	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	-0.0126	-0.0146	-0.0106
	2007	0.0205	0.0239	0.0172
	2008	-0.0032	-0.0040	-0.0024
	2009	-0.0047	-0.0053	-0.0041
5 Point	2005	0.0005	0.0007	0.0003
	2006	-0.0132	-0.0153	-0.0109
	2007	0.0202	0.0235	0.0170
	2008	-0.0032	-0.0040	-0.0024
	2009	-0.0045	-0.0049	-0.0040
6 Point	2004	0.0128	0.0100	0.0157
	2005	-0.0097	-0.0073	-0.0122
	2006	-0.0196	-0.0203	-0.0188
	2007	0.0177	0.0215	0.0139
	2008	-0.0019	-0.0030	-0.0009
	2009	0.0007	-0.0009	0.0023
7 Point	2003	-0.0085	-0.0103	-0.0068
	2004	0.0185	0.0169	0.0203
	2005	-0.0057	-0.0025	-0.0091
	2006	-0.0173	-0.0176	-0.0170
	2007	0.0182	0.0222	0.0143
	2008	-0.0030	-0.0043	-0.0018
	2009	-0.0022	-0.0044	0.0000
8 Point	2002	-0.0078	-0.0077	-0.0080
	2003	-0.0041	-0.0059	-0.0023
	2004	0.0219	0.0202	0.0237
	2005	-0.0035	-0.0003	-0.0068
	2006	-0.0162	-0.0165	-0.0158
	2007	0.0182	0.0222	0.0143
	2008	-0.0041	-0.0054	-0.0029
	2009	-0.0044	-0.0066	-0.0022
9 Point	2001	-0.0130	-0.0150	-0.0110
	2002	-0.0013	-0.0002	-0.0024
	2003	0.0010	0.0000	0.0020
	2004	0.0256	0.0244	0.0268
	2005	-0.0012	0.0024	-0.0048
	2006	-0.0153	-0.0154	-0.0150
	2007	0.0178	0.0217	0.0139
	2008	-0.0060	-0.0076	-0.0045
	2009	-0.0077	-0.0103	-0.0050
10 Point	2000	0.0110	0.0148	0.0073
	2001	-0.0179	-0.0215	-0.0143
	2002	-0.0052	-0.0055	-0.0051
	2003	-0.0020	-0.0041	0.0000
	2004	0.0234	0.0216	0.0254
	2005	-0.0024	0.0008	-0.0056
	2006	-0.0156	-0.0158	-0.0152
	2007	0.0184	0.0225	0.0143
	2008	-0.0045	-0.0055	-0.0035
	2009	-0.0052	-0.0070	-0.0034

MEDICAL Expon'l RESIDUALS	Policy Year	Loss Ratio Average (Pd & Inc)	Loss Ratio (Incur)	Loss Ratio (Pd-23)
4 Point	2006	-0.0124	-0.0143	-0.0105
	2007	0.0207	0.0241	0.0173
	2008	-0.0030	-0.0037	-0.0023
	2009	-0.0046	-0.0052	-0.0041
5 Point	2005	0.0006	0.0008	0.0004
	2006	-0.0130	-0.0151	-0.0109
	2007	0.0204	0.0237	0.0171
	2008	-0.0030	-0.0037	-0.0023
	2009	-0.0043	-0.0048	-0.0039
6 Point	2004	0.0130	0.0101	0.0160
	2005	-0.0094	-0.0070	-0.0119
	2006	-0.0192	-0.0199	-0.0185
	2007	0.0179	0.0218	0.0141
	2008	-0.0018	-0.0028	-0.0008
	2009	0.0005	-0.0011	0.0021
7 Point	2003	-0.0085	-0.0104	-0.0067
	2004	0.0187	0.0170	0.0205
	2005	-0.0055	-0.0022	-0.0088
	2006	-0.0170	-0.0172	-0.0167
	2007	0.0185	0.0225	0.0145
	2008	-0.0029	-0.0041	-0.0017
	2009	-0.0022	-0.0043	0.0000
8 Point	2002	-0.0078	-0.0079	-0.0079
	2003	-0.0040	-0.0059	-0.0022
	2004	0.0220	0.0204	0.0238
	2005	-0.0033	0.0000	-0.0066
	2006	-0.0159	-0.0162	-0.0156
	2007	0.0185	0.0225	0.0145
	2008	-0.0040	-0.0052	-0.0028
	2009	-0.0043	-0.0064	-0.0022
9 Point	2001	-0.0130	-0.0151	-0.0110
	2002	-0.0012	-0.0002	-0.0023
	2003	0.0012	0.0001	0.0022
	2004	0.0258	0.0247	0.0270
	2005	-0.0010	0.0027	-0.0046
	2006	-0.0150	-0.0151	-0.0148
	2007	0.0180	0.0220	0.0141
	2008	-0.0058	-0.0073	-0.0043
	2009	-0.0075	-0.0100	-0.0049
10 Point	2000	0.0109	0.0147	0.0073
	2001	-0.0178	-0.0214	-0.0142
	2002	-0.0051	-0.0053	-0.0049
	2003	-0.0018	-0.0038	0.0002
	2004	0.0237	0.0220	0.0256
	2005	-0.0021	0.0012	-0.0054
	2006	-0.0153	-0.0155	-0.0150
	2007	0.0186	0.0227	0.0145
	2008	-0.0043	-0.0054	-0.0034
	2009	-0.0052	-0.0071	-0.0033